



## **Civil Rights Department Commission on the State of Hate**

2218 Kausen Drive, Suite 100 | Elk Grove | CA | 95758  
800-884-1684 (voice) | 800-700-2320 (TTY) | California's Relay Service at 711  
www.calcivilrights.ca.gov | contact.center@dfeh.ca.gov

### **COMMISSION ON THE STATE OF HATE**

#### **Meeting Notice and Agenda**

**August 25, 2023 10:30 a.m.**

**Location: Hybrid**

**Harper Alumni Center at Sacramento State  
7490 College Town Drive  
Sacramento, CA 95819**

#### **Commissioners Present**

Chair Russell Roybal  
Vice Chair Bamby Salcedo  
Commissioner Regina Cuellar  
Commissioner Cece Feiler  
Commissioner Brian Levin  
Commissioner Shirin Sinnar  
Commissioner Erroll G. Southers

#### **Ex-Officio Members Present**

Abby Browning, Governor's Office of Emergency Services

#### **Civil Rights Department Staff Present**

Kevin Kish, CRD Director  
Adam Romero, CRD Deputy Directory  
Becky Monroe, CRD Deputy Director  
Alec Watts, CRD Deputy Director  
Gregory Mann, CRD CCRU  
Christina Teixeira, CRD CCRU  
Taylor Whitely, Associate Governmental Program Analyst  
Monica Chavez, Associate Governmental Program Analyst  
Rebecca Goodsell, Data Research Specialist

#### **Others Present**

An estimated 20 members of the public participated virtually.  
An estimated 6 members of the public participated in person.

I. **Welcome**

a. **Call to Order**

Chair Roybal called the meeting to order at 10:30 a.m.

They welcomed everyone to the seventh meeting of the California Commission on the State of Hate and shared that translated closed captioning is available for this meeting.

Commissioner Cuellar provided a land acknowledgment.

Chair Roybal held a moment of silence for the deaths of O'Shae Sibley and Laura Ann Carleton. A link to California vs. Hate was shared in the chat.

b. **Establishment of a Quorum**

CRD Assistant Deputy Director, Alec Watts conducted roll call.

c. **Review of the Agenda**

Chair Roybal invited everyone to the Commission's second community forum that will take place following the Commission meeting. They then reviewed the public comment process and agenda for the meeting.

II. **Approval of the Minutes**

Chair Roybal reviewed the minutes from the June meeting and Community Forum and asked for comments, discussion, and public comment on the minutes.

No edits by Commissioners.

**Action by the Commission**

Commissioner Feiler moved to approve the minutes. Commissioner Levin seconded.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the minutes.

III. **Civil Rights Department Report**

Assistant Deputy Director Watts provided four Civil Rights Department updates.

IV. **Discussion and Action Regarding the Commission's Member Handbook**

Chair Roybal outlined the proposed edits to the Commission's Member Handbook. (See Attachment B.)

Commissioner Feiler moved to approve amendments. Commissioner Cuellar seconded.

### Commission Discussion

Commissioner Levin stated that he would prefer the Commission still have to file a Form 700.

- Chair Roybal clarified that Commissioners may still file Form 700, however according to the FPPC guidelines the Commissioner is not required to fill it out but will still be encouraged to do so.
- Assistant Deputy Director Watts mentioned that the guidance from the FPPC and legal counsel to Commission being an advisory body, as of right now, they will not have to fill out the Form 700.
- Commissioner Levin wanted to leave the possibility open of amending the handbook back.
  - o Chair Roybal confirmed the FPPC mentioned this guidance may be subject to change down the line.
  - o Commissioner Sinnar noted that the language proposed to be amended notes that that, if the Commission's recommendations are accepted or adopted regularly without significant modification by government bodies, then the exemption may no longer apply.

Vice Chair Salcedo wanted clarification on an earlier comment regarding the Commission being an advisory body versus a rule making body.

- Assistant Deputy Director Watts clarified that the Commission is an advisory body charged with making policy recommendations for the Legislature and Governor, but does not pass policies itself.

### Commission Action

Chair Roybal along with Vice Chair Salcedo and Commissioners Feiler, Cuellar, Sinnar, and Southers voted to approve the amendments to the Commission's handbook.

Commissioner Leven opposed the amendments.

The amendments passed by a vote of 6

## V. **Informational Presentation and Discussion**

Commissioner Levin announced his departure from CSUSB and gave a presentation on the latest hate crime trends in the presidential election year.

### Commission discussion

Commissioner Feiler inquired as to why these trends appear during election years.

- Commissioner Levin provided multiple explanations as to why these trends spike during

election years.

- Chair Roybal that the Subcommittee on Community Forums is focusing on discussing some of these topics and using this research is an option.

### Public Comment

An in-person commentor highlighted significant gaps in official data, particularly regarding underreporting of anti-disability and gender-based hate.

A remote commentor expressed concerns about countering online radicalization without infringing upon the First Amendment.

## VI. Chair and Subcommittee Updates and Discussion

### A. Chair Russell Roybal

Chair Roybal announced that Rebecca Goodsell, a Research Data Specialist for the Commission, is the newest employee in the Civil Rights Department. They shared that the Commission's annual report is under review by the administration.

Chair Roybal notified everyone that the September and December Commission meeting that occur at the end of the month have been canceled. There will be a hybrid community forum and commission meeting sometime in the first two weeks of December.

Chair Roybal congratulated Commissioner Southers for being elected unanimously as the President of the Los Angeles Board of Police Commission.

### B. Subcommittee on Data and Research

Updates by Commissioner Sinnar:

Three goals the subcommittee is working on are (1) generating new research, (2) translating research into policy, and (3) enhancing accessibility.

There are three research projects that are in the works. The first project is with the California Health Interview Survey which focuses on what victims experience and identifying what their unmet needs are. The second project relates to academic research on public messaging associated with hate crime prevention. The third project is oriented around prevention with the Initiative to Study Hate with UCLA.

Commissioner Sinnar opened a discussion on areas that the Commissioners felt needed more research.

- Commissioner Cuellar shared that her Subcommittee's research interests are on rapid response rapid and language access barriers and what resources current state

agencies have.

- Commissioner Southers provided research needs of the Subcommittee on Recommendations for Law Enforcement

### **C. Subcommittee on Policy Recommendations**

Updates provided by Commissioner Cuellar:

The subcommittee is focusing on rapid response rapid response and language access barriers and what resources current state agencies have when a hate incident occurs. There are two main areas of research that the subcommittee is working on which are, (1) synthesize research on how to best support victims of hate crimes, and (2) evaluating and compiling resources of existing training of employees of state agencies related to recognizing and responding to hate.

- Commissioner Levin discussed adding undocumented immigrants in this research and help include them in possible policy solutions.

### **D. Subcommittee on Recommendations for Law Enforcement**

Updates by Commissioner Southers:

The subcommittee is working on a law enforcement training and education project. This will include compiling and evaluating tools, practices, resources trainings, and best practices that have been successful in responding to and or reducing hate activity that law enforcement agencies have and how they prioritize in their different organizations. The subcommittee is also looking at how law enforcement and prosecutorial bodies are collecting data, reporting, investigating, and prosecuting hate crimes.

The subcommittee is conducting a training video with POST.

There have been meetings with subject matter experts regarding online hate groups and shared possible policy recommendations based on that data. There is a new ADL report about extremists co-opting public comment period at local government meetings. The subcommittee is having conversations as to what actions can be taken to mitigate this problem.

- Commissioner Sinnar had a follow-up question regarding collaborating for research, specifically regarding the prosecution of hate crimes.
- Asked Commission Levin to share his data on penalty enhancements as it relates to hate crimes.
- Commissioner Levin shared some insights on reporting data.
- Commissioner Sinnar provided research organizations that are already doing DOJ data on crime that would be organizations to collaborate with.
- Commissioner Southers gave more context regarding the goal of the POST training.

### **E. Subcommittee on Community Forums**

Updates by Commissioner Feiler:

There will be a community forum following this Commission meeting that will be focusing on the effects of hate on mental health. The third community forum will focus on the effects of hate on youth, bullying, and social media. There will be a fourth community forum before the end of the calendar year.

- Commissioner Levin discussed some of the research the Williams Institute has conducted.

**F. Subcommittee on Funding**

This agenda item was skipped.

**Public Comment**

An in-person commenter discussed the purpose for the Bagley Keene Act.

A remote commenter referenced their subcommittee's reliance on the Commission for data, reporting, messaging, and responses. They highlighted inconsistencies in the definitions of hate incidents vs. hate crimes and called for a uniform definition for statewide use.

**VII. Commission Member Announcements**

No Commission member announcements

**VIII. Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda**

No public comment on Items not on the agenda.

**IX. Future Agenda Items**

No future agenda items discussed.

**X. Adjournment of the Meeting**

Chair Roybal reminded everyone of the Community Forum following the commission meeting.

Commissioner Cuellar moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Levin seconded the motion.

Chair Roybal adjourned the meeting at 12:22 PM