



Civil Rights Department Commission on the State of Hate

2218 Kausen Drive, Suite 100 | Elk Grove | CA | 95758
800-884-1684 (voice) | 800-700-2320 (TTY) | California's Relay Service at 711
www.calcivilrights.ca.gov | contact.center@dfeh.ca.gov

COMMISSION ON THE STATE OF HATE

Meeting Notice and Agenda

August 25, 2023, 10:30 a.m.

Location: Hybrid

**Harper Alumni Center at Sacramento State
7490 College Town Drive
Sacramento, CA 95819**

Commissioners Present

Chair Russell Roybal
Vice Chair Bamby Salcedo
Commissioner Regina Cuellar
Commissioner Cece Feiler
Commissioner Brian Levin
Commissioner Shirin Sinnar
Commissioner Erroll G. Southers

Ex-Officio Members Present

Abby Browning, Governor's Office of Emergency Services

Civil Rights Department Staff Present

Kevin Kish, CRD Director
Adam Romero, CRD Deputy Director
Becky Monroe, CRD Deputy Director
Alec Watts, CRD Deputy Director
Gregory Mann, CRD CCRU
Christina Teixeira, CRD CCRU
Taylor Whitely, Associate Governmental Program Analyst
Monica Chavez, Associate Governmental Program Analyst
Rebecca Goodsell, Data Research Specialist

Others Present

An estimated 20 members of the public participated virtually.
An estimated 6 members of the public participated in person.

I. **Welcome**

a. **Call to Order**

Chair Roybal called the meeting to order at 10:30 a.m.

They welcomed everyone to the seventh meeting of the California Commission on the State of Hate and shared that translated closed captioning is available for this meeting.

Commissioner Cuellar provided a land acknowledgment.

Chair Roybal held a moment of silence for the deaths of O'Shae Sibley and Laura Ann Carleton. A link to California vs. Hate was shared in the chat.

b. **Establishment of a Quorum**

CRD Assistant Deputy Director, Alec Watts conducted roll call.

c. **Review of the Agenda**

Chair Roybal invited everyone to the Commission's second community forum that will take place following the Commission meeting. They then reviewed the public comment process and agenda for the meeting.

II. **Approval of the Minutes**

Chair Roybal reviewed the minutes from the June meeting and Community Forum and asked for comments, discussion, and public comment on the minutes.

No edits by Commissioners.

Action by the Commission

Commissioner Feiler moved to approve the minutes. Commissioner Levin seconded.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the minutes.

III. **Civil Rights Department Report**

Assistant Deputy Director Watts provided four Civil Rights Department updates.

IV. **Discussion and Action Regarding the Commission's Member Handbook**

Chair Roybal outlined the proposed edits to the Commission's Member Handbook. (See Attachment B.)

Commissioner Feiler moved to approve amendments. Commissioner Cuellar seconded.

Commission Discussion

- Commissioner Levin stated that he would prefer the Commission still have to file a Form 700.
- Chair Roybal clarified that Commissioners may still file Form 700, but according to the FPPC guidelines the Commissioner is not required to fill it out but will still be encouraged to do so.
- Assistant Deputy Director Watts mentioned that the guidance from the FPPC and legal counsel is that because Commission is an advisory body, as of right now, members will not have to fill out the Form 700.
- Commissioner Levin wanted to leave the possibility open of amending the handbook back.
- Chair Roybal confirmed the FPPC mentioned this guidance may be subject to change down the line.
- Commissioner Sinnar noted that the language proposed to be amended notes that that, if the Commission's recommendations are accepted or adopted regularly without significant modification by government bodies, then the exemption may no longer apply.

Vice Chair Salcedo wanted clarification on an earlier comment regarding the Commission being an advisory body versus a rule making body.

- Assistant Deputy Director Watts clarified that the Commission is an advisory body charged with making policy recommendations for the Legislature and Governor, but does not pass policies itself.

Commission Action

Chair Roybal along with Vice Chair Salcedo and Commissioners Feiler, Cuellar, Sinnar, and Southers voted to approve the amendments to the Commission's handbook.

Commissioner Leven opposed the amendments.

The amendments passed:

- Ayes: 6
- Nos: 1
- Abstain: 0

V. **Informational Presentation and Discussion**

Commissioner Levin announced his departure from CSUSB and gave a presentation on the latest hate crime trends in the presidential election year.

Commission discussion

Commissioner Feiler inquired as to why these trends appear during election years.

- Commissioner Levin provided multiple explanations as to why these trends spike during

election years.

- Chair Roybal pointed out that the Subcommittee on Community Forums is focusing on discussing some of these topics.

Public Comment

An in-person commentor highlighted significant gaps in official data, particularly regarding underreporting of anti-disability and gender-based hate.

A remote commentor expressed concerns about countering online radicalization without infringing upon the First Amendment.

VI. Chair and Subcommittee Updates and Discussion

A. Chair Russell Roybal

Chair Roybal announced that Rebecca Goodsell, a Research Data Specialist for the Commission, is the newest employee in the Civil Rights Department. They shared that the Commission's annual report is under review by the administration.

Chair Roybal notified everyone that the September and December Commission meeting that occur at the end of the month have been canceled. There will be a hybrid community forum and commission meeting sometime in the first two weeks of December.

Chair Roybal congratulated Commissioner Southers for being elected unanimously as the President of the Los Angeles Board of Police Commission.

B. Subcommittee on Data and Research

Updates by Commissioner Sinnar:

Three goals the subcommittee is working on are (1) generating new research, (2) translating research into policy, and (3) enhancing accessibility.

There are three research projects that are in the works. The first project is with the California Health Interview Survey which focuses on what victims experience and identifying what their unmet needs are. The second project relates to academic research on public messaging associated with hate crime prevention. The third project is oriented around prevention with the Initiative to Study Hate with UCLA.

Commissioner Sinnar opened a discussion on areas that the Commissioners felt needed more research.

- Commissioner Cuellar shared that her Subcommittee's research interests are on rapid response rapid and language access barriers and what resources current state

agencies have.

- Commissioner Southers provided research needs of the Subcommittee on Recommendations for Law Enforcement

C. Subcommittee on Policy Recommendations

Updates provided by Commissioner Cuellar:

The subcommittee is focusing on rapid response rapid response and language access barriers and what resources current state agencies have when a hate incident occurs. There are two main areas of research that the subcommittee is working on which are, (1) synthesize research on how to best support victims of hate crimes, and (2) evaluating and compiling resources of existing training of employees of state agencies related to recognizing and responding to hate.

- Commissioner Levin discussed adding undocumented immigrants in this research and help include them in possible policy solutions.

D. Subcommittee on Recommendations for Law Enforcement

Updates by Commissioner Southers:

The subcommittee is working on a law enforcement training and education project.

The subcommittee is conducting a training video with POST.

There have been meetings with subject matter experts regarding online hate groups and policy recommendations based on that data. There is a new ADL report about extremists co-opting public comment period at local government meetings. The subcommittee is having conversations as to what actions can be taken to mitigate this problem.

- Commissioner Sinnar had a follow-up question regarding collaborating for research, specifically regarding the prosecution of hate crimes. She asked Commissioner Levin to share his data on penalty enhancements as it relates to hate crimes.
- Commissioner Levin shared some insights on reporting data.
- Commissioner Sinnar provided research organizations that are already doing DOJ data on crime that would be organizations to collaborate with.
- Commissioner Southers gave more context regarding the goal of the POST training.

E. Subcommittee on Community Forums

Updates by Commissioner Feiler:

There will be a community forum following this Commission meeting that will be focusing on the effects of hate on mental health. The third community forum will focus on the effects of hate on youth, bullying, and social media. There will be a fourth community forum before the end of the calendar year.

- Commissioner Levin discussed some of the research the Williams Institute has conducted.

F. Subcommittee on Funding

This agenda item was skipped.

Public Comment

An in-person commenter discussed the purpose for the Bagley Keene Act.

A remote commenter referenced their subcommittee's reliance on the Commission for data, reporting, messaging, and responses. They highlighted inconsistencies in the definitions of hate incidents vs. hate crimes and called for a uniform definition for statewide use.

VII. Commission Member Announcements

No Commission member announcements

VIII. Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

No public comment on Items not on the agenda.

IX. Future Agenda Items

No future agenda items discussed.

X. Adjournment of the Meeting

- Chair Roybal reminded everyone of the Community Forum following the commission meeting.
- Commissioner Cuellar moved to adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Levin seconded the motion.
- Chair Roybal adjourned the meeting at 12:22 PM



Civil Rights Department Commission on the State of Hate

2218 Kausen Drive, Suite 100 | Elk Grove | CA | 95758
800-884-1684 (voice) | 800-700-2320 (TTY) | California's Relay Service at 711
www.calcivilrights.ca.gov | contact.center@dfeh.ca.gov

COMMISSION ON THE STATE OF HATE

Meeting Notice and Agenda

August 25, 2023 12:30 p.m.

Location: Hybrid

Harper Alumni Center at Sacramento State

7490 College Town Drive

Sacramento, CA 95819

Commissioners Present

Chair Russell Roybal
Commissioner Regina Cuellar
Commissioner Cece Feiler
Commissioner Brian Levin
Commissioner Shirin Sinnar
Commissioner Erroll G. Southers

Ex-Officio Members Present

Abby Browning, Governor's Office of Emergency Services

Civil Rights Department Staff Present

Kevin Kish, CRD Director
Adam Romero, CRD Deputy Directory
Becky Monroe, CRD Deputy Director
Alec Watts, CRD Deputy Director
Gregory Mann, CRD CCRU
Christina Teixeira, CRD CCRU
Taylor Whitely, Associate Governmental Program Analyst
Monica Chavez, Associate Governmental Program Analyst
Rebecca Goodsell, Data Research Specialist

Others Present

An estimated 84 members of the public participated virtually.
An estimated 6 members of the public participated in person.

I. Welcome

Commissioner Cuellar welcomed everyone to the second community forum on understanding the mental health impact of hate.

She reviewed the process for translated closed captioning. She then provided a land acknowledgment and shared the CA vs. Hate Hotline.

Commissioner Cuellar introduced herself and had the following Commissioners introduce themselves: Commissioner Levin, Commissioner Southers, Chair Roybal, Commissioner Sinnar, and Commissioner Feiler.

Commissioner Feiler explained the public comment process.

Commissioner Cuellar shared the goals of the Commission and reviewed the agenda.

II. Informational Presentation: Hate as a Risk for Ill-Health in LGBT Populations Ilan H. Meyer, Ph.D., Williams Distinguished Senior Scholar of Public Policy, Williams Institute, UCLA School of Law

Dr. Ilan H. Meyer shared the following information in his presentation:

There is a resurgence of anti-LGBTQ rhetoric and violence, including increased numbers in California. The LGBTQ community is a small percentage of the US population, but given how much they are discussed, it seems as though the number is larger than it is. Even though LGBTQ rights have increased, homophobia and transphobia are embedded in American history and culture and produces stress. This is referred to as minority stress.

Data collected by the Department of Justice as part of the National Crime Victimization Survey found that the odds of experiencing violent victimization is four times higher for member of the LGBTQ community. There are greater instances of bullying and workplace discrimination against members of the LGBTQ community, especially if they are also people of color. People in the LGBTQ community are more likely to experience socioeconomic disparities and stress.

Even though there have been legal strides for LGBTQ rights, younger people experience similar levels of minority stresses related to stigma and prejudice as their older peers had experienced.

There are prevention strategies and interventions that can be taken, ranging from the individuals being provided sensitive and accessible mental health services and providing mental health prevention in schools. Dr. Meyer also shared policy recommendations.

Public comment

One commenter inquired about high school bullying and increased bullying against trans youth.

- Dr. Meyer responded that his data was youth specific and shared that the William's Institute data can be found on the website.

III. Informational Presentation: Eraka Bath, M.D., Director, Child Forensic Services, Professor, Department of Psychiatry, Vice Chair for Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion, Jane and Terry Semel Institute for Neuroscience and Human Behavior, UCLA

Information presented by Dr. Eraka Bath:

The presentation began with a land grant acknowledgment and a disclosure of sources that have provided funding to Dr. Bath's work.

Some of the biggest public health threats are hate-based behaviors such as violence, racism, and discrimination. Some of these are intersectional. Victims of violence of hate are subject to a range of violence, including death. Hate crimes, hate speech, and discrimination exist along a continuum of discrimination due to structural bias and prejudice, which is the foundation of hate-based violence.

There are gaps in legislative measures addressing manifestations of violence and structural violence. Dr. Bath highlighted the need for comprehensive legislation. She cited the recent passing of anti-lynching laws in 2022 as an example of the time it takes to push for such legislation.

The presentation discussed the negative health effects of racism, which overlaps with various forms of structural bias, such as transphobia, homophobia, ableism, sexism, and xenophobia. Structural determinants contribute to negative health outcomes for marginalized groups.

Hate crimes have a broad range of negative effects, including economic, educational, and housing disparities. The trauma from hate crimes can persist for generations, exacerbating pre-existing trauma and sensitizing individuals to further harm. Dr. Bath discussed the broader impact of hate crimes on communities, emphasizing the negative mental health effects, such as increased suicide ideation, depression, anxiety, and post-traumatic stress disorder. The mental health consequences affect not only the direct victims but entire communities.

The presentation concluded with discussing hate-motivated behavior interventions, public health recommendations, and the Revolutionary Love Project.

Public comment

A remote commentor wanted more information about underreporting due to stigma and distrust of law enforcement.

- Dr. Bath responded by offering potential options to discuss solutions as well as addressing some of the challenges that come with that.

An in-person commentor mentioned difficulties of reporting hate incidents.

Another remote commentor discussed the mental health effects on the community

resulting from incidents involving the Antioch Police Department.

One remote commentor inquired about the process and variations in gathering intersectionality and weathering data among different minority communities.

- Dr. Bath provided examples of intersectional identities and privilege.
 - o The commentor also asked about ways to distribute this data back to the communities served.
 - o Dr. Bath mentioned other researchers doing this work and argued for co-sharing research.

Another remote commentor sought insights into racial trauma, particularly in relation to youth.

- Dr. Bath discussed her expertise with youth and discussed the largest structural drivers to the school to prison pipeline.

Commissioner comment

Commissioner Levin asked what can be done at the individual level.

- Dr. Bath responded that it is important to start by centering the most marginalized and vulnerable groups and listening to their needs while amplifying their voices.
- Commissioner Levin asked about a more interpersonal level rather than at an institutional or legislative level.
 - o Dr. Bath responded by saying it is important to create safe havens.

IV. Informational Presentations on Mental Health Resources

A. Eric Harris, Director of Public Policy, Disability Rights California

Eric Harris shared the following information in his presentation:

Disability Rights California is a statewide non-profit organization that advocates on behalf of people with disabilities, offering free legal services across the state.

Mental health advocacy and the prevalence of hate crimes and incidents against disabled individuals, particularly those with multiple marginalized identities, is an important issue. People with disabilities often go uncared for due to misdiagnoses, lack of access to resources, and societal stigma. Disabled individuals, particularly disabled women and disabled black women, are more likely to be victims of hate crimes.

The presentation delved into the reasons why disabled people are often victims of hate crimes, citing their association with other marginalized groups and the history of bullying and discrimination. Harris also pointed out that disabled individuals who experience hate crimes often endure mental health crises, trauma, and, in some cases, post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD).

There was a discussion about available resources for disabled individuals, such as peer-run organizations, family groups, and independent living centers.

B. Traute Winters, Executive Director, National Alliance on Mental Illness Greater Los Angeles County

Information presented by Traute Winters:

The National Alliance on Mental Illness (NAMI) is one of the nation's largest grassroots mental health non-profit organizations. NAMI is a peer-run organization that includes families, friends, and individuals living with any type of mental illness. Their primary purpose is to provide resources and support for individuals, families, and communities dealing with mental illness. They offer confidential, no-cost support groups for individuals with mental health conditions and family members and caregivers. These support groups are peer-led and help people connect with others facing similar challenges.

Traute Winters discussed some of NAMI's major programs, such as "Family to Family," an eight-week class that educates families about different mental health conditions, improves coping skills, and emphasizes self-care. "Basics" is a similar program designed for parents and guardians of youth under 22 with mental health conditions.

NAMI offers public education programs like "In Our Own Voice" to reduce the stigma surrounding mental illness. "Ending the Silence" targets middle and high school students, teaching them about the signs and symptoms of mental health conditions, early warning signs, and encouraging help-seeking behavior, including suicide prevention.

NAMI has a "Family and Parent Voice" Speaker's Bureau where family members and parents share their experiences with mental illness, serving as resources to others. NAMI also conducts law enforcement training, partnering with law enforcement agencies to help officers understand how to communicate with individuals in mental health crises.

All NAMI programs and classes are free of charge to the public, and they encourage individuals to reach out and connect with their local NAMI affiliate.

Public comment

A remote commentor mentioned the normalization of hate speech against the disabled community and asked about strategies to help people recognize such language as hate speech.

- Erik Harris responded that one answer would be to call out disability hate speech right away. Another solution would be to place people with disabilities in decision-making roles.

One in-person commentor mentioned the stigma or recovery when individuals aren't seeking interventions.

Commissioner comment

Commissioner Sinnar inquired about finding mental health resources especially for folks who have cultural or linguistic barriers.

- Traute Winters responded by sharing that NAMI has resources as well as being able to connect individuals to other resources that would meet those needs.

V. Facilitated Public Comment and Discussion

Public comment

One in-person commentor discussed the mental health impacts of the Covid-19 pandemic on the Asian community, exacerbated by increased hate crimes. They suggested examining the pandemic's societal effects at both statewide and community levels.

Another in-person commentor shared insights into their organization's work on intervention and prevention programs involving youth and members of various ethnic backgrounds.

Commissioner discussion

Commissioner Levin mentioned Stop AAPI Hate, the Center for the Study of Hate and Extremism, and the Asian American Bar Association as resources.

Chair Roybal thanked all the presenters on behalf of the Commission.

VI. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 2:57 p.m.