



Civil Rights Department • Commission on the State of Hate

2218 Kausen Drive, Suite 100 | Elk Grove | CA | 95758
800-884-1684 (voice) | 800-700-2320 (TTY) | California's Relay Service at 711
www.calcivilrights.ca.gov | contact.center@calcivilrights.ca.gov

COMMISSION ON THE STATE OF HATE

Meeting Notice and Agenda

June 28, 2023, 9:00 am PST

Commissioners Present

Chair Russell Roybal
Vice Chair Bamby Salcedo
Commissioner Regina Cuellar
Commissioner Andrea Beth Damsky
Commissioner Cece Feiler
Commissioner Erroll G. Southers

Civil Rights Department Staff Present

Becky Monroe, CRD Deputy Director
Alec Watts, CRD Assistant Deputy Director
Gregory Mann, CRD CCRU
Christina Teixeira, CRD CCRU

Others Present

An estimated 13 members of the public participated virtually.

I. Welcome **A. Call to Order**

Chair Roybal called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

They welcomed everyone to the sixth meeting of the California Commission on the State of Hate and shared that translated closed captioning is available for this meeting.

They acknowledged the recently celebrated Juneteenth and that this is Pride month.

B. Establishment of a Quorum

CRD Assistant Deputy Director, Alec Watts conducted roll call.

C. Review of the Agenda

Chair Roybal reviewed the public comment process and agenda for the meeting.

They noted that the meeting will skip agenda item IV, Discussion and Action Regarding the Commission's Member Handbook.

II. Approval of the Minutes

Chair Roybal reviewed the minutes from the May meeting and Community Forum.

Commissioner Feiler moved to approve the minutes. Commissioner Cuellar seconded.

Chair Roybal asked for comments, discussion, and public comment on the minutes.

No edits by Commissioners.

Public Comment

No public Comment

Action by the Commission

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the minutes.

III. Civil Rights Department Report

Deputy Director, Becky Monroe, provided an update on the CA vs. Hate Resource Line's current data.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Feiler raised a question regarding the accuracy of the current hate incident data.

- Deputy Director Monroe acknowledged that there is still underreporting despite increased usage of the hotline.

Commissioner Levin shared additional hate incident related data and research.

- Deputy Director Monroe highlighted anti-hate initiatives undertaken by other state agencies and community organizations.

Deputy Director Monroe provided an additional update on the recent project launch of the Community Conflict Resolution Unit (CCRU).

Commissioner Southers emphasized Commissioner Feiler's efforts in engaging with the faith-based communities regarding disasters and access to resources, acknowledging that law cannot handle all aspects of reporting.

Vice Chair Salcedo highlighted the importance of this initiative and reporting.

IV. Discussion and Action Regarding the Commission's Member Handbook

This agenda item was skipped.

V. Chair and Subcommittees Updates and Discussion

A. Chair Russell Roybal

Updates by Chair Roybal:

Commissioner Sinnar recently received the Outstanding Mentor Award from the Faculty Women's Forum at Stanford University.

The California Department of Justice just released its 2022 annual Hate Crime in California Report. [Below is the link to the report that was shared in the chat.]

<https://oag.ca.gov/system/files/attachments/press-docs/Hate%20Crime%20In%20CA%202022f.pdf>

Changes to the Bagley Keene Act, effective at the end of June, will require the Commission conduct in-person meetings. Staff is currently working to understand the requirements and determine the details of the next meeting, including the venue and time.

The Commission received feedback from a coalition of groups requesting the establishment of a subcommittee on hate-related bullying. The Commission does not have any external subcommittee or subcommittees focused on a specific topic area. The Commission is working on developing a formal process around receiving input and collaborating with external organizations.

The Commission has been asked to take a position on several bills in the Legislature. The Subcommittee on Policy Recommendations should convene and make a recommendation to the Commission regarding taking a stance on pending legislation.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Cuellar mentioned that the Subcommittee on Policy Recommendations has had preliminary discussions on the topic but welcomed additional feedback.

Commissioner Levin inquired about the policy on individual Commissioners taking a position on Legislation.

- Chair Roybal clarified that Commissioners are allowed endorse legislation as private citizens but not on behalf of the Commission.
- Deputy Director Watts added that endorsing legislation is within the discretion of the Commissioners in their personal capacities, separate from their roles as Commissioners.
- Chair Roybal emphasized clearly stating that endorsements of legislation are made as private citizens and not on behalf of the Commission.

- Commissioner Damsky shared her best practice of always ensuring it is known that she is not speaking as Commissioner when attending events.

B. Subcommittee on Data and Research

Updates by Commissioner Levin:

The subcommittee is engaged in various projects, including a survey on hate crimes and incidents in collaboration with the California Health Interview Service (CHIS).

Assistant Deputy Director Watts shared more details and highlighted that the survey is being conducted at both the state and county levels.

Commissioner Levin provided additional information on the survey research and the type of content being included.

C. Subcommittee on Policy Recommendations

Updates by Commissioner Cuellar:

The subcommittee has hired an individual to assist with their work.

Language access for survivors of hate crimes has been a focal point for the subcommittee.

The subcommittee is in the process of compiling a list of organizations or groups with subject matter experts on hate, discrimination, and transphobia. Commissioners are encouraged to contact staff if they have any recommendations.

There was a brief discussion on the Commission potentially taking a position on legislation, with plans for a more comprehensive conversation in the future.

D. Subcommittee on Recommendations for Law Enforcement

Updates by Commissioner Southers:

There have been conversations about having other subcommittees rotate in providing the content for future community forums.

The subcommittee has received inquiries from interested research students and PhD graduates willing to work with the Commission. Other Commissioners were encouraged to reach out if they if they require researchers.

Mentioned that he knows people who could be added to Commissioner Cuellar's database on subject matter experts and getting her in contact with people who could serve as advisory members of the Commission.

The subcommittee has made progress with POST on training videos for law enforcement agencies across California. There is potential for future collaborations and training opportunities.

Chair Roybal suggested the possibility of collaborating with other subcommittees and converting it into a public meeting, inviting suggestions for potential collaborations.

E. Subcommittee on Community Forums

Updates by Commissioner Cuellar:

The next community forum will possibly be postponed due to the provisions of the Bagley-Keene Act. The next community forum's topic will focus on the impacts of hate on mental health. There are currently two people being considered to present at the next community forum and if there are any experts Commissioners suggest reaching out to, suggestions welcomed.

Commissioner Feiler added that they are specifically looking for experts that can touch on mental health resources.

Commissioner Cuellar sought feedback from the Commissioners on the community forum to make improvements for future events.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Damsky proposed allowing each subcommittee to organize a presentation at one of the community forums as Commissioner Southers mentioned earlier. She also asked if the forums will be held after the Commission meetings. If so, there should only be one presentation to not have such a long day. Due to the changes in Bagley-Keene the July meeting and community forum might have to be postponed.

- Commissioner Feiler responded that her and Commissioner Cuellar agreed that there needs to be revisions regarding the length of time of the presentations.
- Commissioner Damsky suggested facilitating a conversation rather than multiple presentations.

Vice Chair Salcedo shared what she enjoyed from the community forum.

Commissioner Feiler said that once the community forums are conducted in person that they ought to be throughout the state rather than just at one location.

F. Subcommittee on Funding

This agenda item was skipped.

Public Comment

One commenter talked about the current police officers being investigated for misconduct and the public comment at Civil Council meetings to spread conspiracy theories to attack the public figures. They wondered how the Commission deals or would deal with these issues without violating the Brown Act.

- Chair Roybal suggested they reach out to the CCRU.
- Commissioner Levin shared addition resources that the commentor can reach out to.

Another commentor shared that while the community forum was informative the focus moving forward should be on the community being able to share their comments rather than just be all presentations.

VI. Commission Member Announcements

Commissioner Damsky spoke about the current attack on women public officials.

Commissioner Levin shared current hate crime and incident data in California.

Commissioner Damsky acknowledged that it was Eid al-Adha, an important Muslim Holiday.

VII. Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

The Commission may not discuss or act on any matter raised during the public comment section that is not included on this agenda, except whether to decide to place the matter on the agenda of a future meeting. (Government Code §§ 11125 and 11125.7 (a))

Public Comment

This commentor highlighted the work of the current Walnut Creek Chief of Police and the efforts of the CA v. Hate hotline, as well as CCRU.

VIII. Future Agenda Items

IX. Adjournment of the meeting

Commissioner Cuellar moved to adjourn, and Commissioner Levin seconded. Meeting adjourned at 10:23 a.m.

Meetings of the Commission on the State of Hate (Commission) of the Civil Rights Department (CRD) are open to the public except when specifically noticed otherwise in accordance with the Open Meeting Act. Public comments will be taken on agenda items at the time the specific item is raised. If public comment is not specifically requested, members of the public should feel free to request an opportunity to comment. Total time allocated for public comment may be limited. The Commission may take action on any item listed on the agenda, unless listed as informational only. All times are approximate and subject to change. Agenda items may be taken out of order to accommodate speakers and to maintain a

quorum. The meeting may be cancelled without notice. For verification of the meeting and its virtual address, call 800-884-1684 (voice) or 800-700-2320 (TTY) or access CRD's Web site at www.calcivilrights.ca.gov. To submit comments during the virtual meeting, e-mail the Commission at CSH@calcivilrights.ca.gov. Requests for further information should be directed to Alec Watts at 800-884-1684 (voice) or 800-700-2320 (TTY).

The meeting is open to the public. If you require a disability-related accommodation or modification of policies or procedures to participate in the meeting, make a request as soon as possible or at least 72 hours before the meeting by contacting Mimi de Ville, CRD's ADA Coordinator, at (844) 541-2877 (voice or via relay operator 711) or TTY (800) 884-1684 or via e-mail: accommodations@dfeh.ca.gov.

Date of notice: June 16, 2023